## Asia Pacific Education Review (APER)

Education Research Institute (ERI) Seoul National University, Seoul, Korea

Asia Pacific Education Review (APER) is installed as an internationally referred journal, and aspires to attract and publish high scholarly quality articles and book reviews on education in the Asia-Pacific region. We cordially request your candid assessment of the quality and the publishability of the manuscript enclosed. It will be greatly appreciated if you fill out this confidential evaluation form and send to

Yong-Lin Moon, Editor of APER

Education Research Institute, Seoul National University

San 56-1, Sillim-dong, Kwanak-gu Seoul 151-742, Republic of Korea

Tel: 82-2-880-5896, Fax: 82-2- 878-1665, E-mail: aper@snu.ac.kr

For your reference, we attached below short descriptions concerning the Purpose of the Journal, and the Editorial Board list at the end of this form.

- Your assessment is expected to return by: March 18, 2008
- Title of the Manuscript to be Reviewed: #081009 Review of current studies in instructional design theory in Korea: Major trends and future directions
- \* Due to the increase in the number of submitted articles and in the cost of publishing the journal three times a year, APER is no longer able to offer reviewers an honorarium. Your continuous professional contribution to the journal is greatly appreciated.

Name of Referee	
Affiliation:	Position:
Phone number:	E-mail address:
Address:	
Major research/review area:	
Date	Signature (If you send this by email, you don't need to sign here)
1. This manuscript is approp	oriate as an article ;
_	1
(In your assessment the clear indication research issues, appropriateness,	ns for revisions or reasons for not acceptance: nent, please consider the aspects of each manuscript, such as on of the purpose of study, identification of problems and rationale including theoretical/empirical bases, methodological credible evidence or convincing scholarly claims, and academic plications, etc. Please use additional sheets if needed):

## Asia Pacific Education Review (APER)

Education Research Institute (ERI)

The introduction presents the purpose of the paper and the rationale for its significance in a clear and concise manner. This is a significant topic which can inform the work of researchers in instructional design.

The theoretical framework is adequately addressed, although the distinction between instructional theories and learning theories may not be clear to some readers. The author may wish to elaborate on why he/she considers Sweller's Cognitive Load Theory (CLT) to be a learning theory rather than an instructional theory. CLT builds upon descriptive theories of human cognitive architecture such as Bartlett's (1932, 1958) proposed schemas and Miller's (1956) research on working memory. Furthermore, CLT prescribes that instruction be designed to optimize the load on working memory by minimizing extraneous cognitive load. The author may wish to select as an example a theory that is more clearly a learning theory, and also select a specific instructional design theory for contrast.

The definition of "situation" (p. 4) is too similar to Reigeluth's and should either be an exact quote or reworded: "The *situation* here means those aspects of the context that influence selection of methods."

Reigeluth: "Therefore, I use the term 'situation' to refer to those aspects of the context that do influence selection of methods."

In describing the methodology for selecting and categorizing articles, it may be helpful to describe how the criteria were chosen. Were they determined *a priori* or did they emerge from an exploratory analysis? If the latter, are the categories comprehensive or are potentially useful categories missing because they weren't addressed by any articles in the literature review? Some categories are actually combinations of categories. For example, "Instructional design theory for types of learning" includes some articles that address cognitive domains (conceptual understanding, causal principles, critical thinking) and others that address instructional strategies (goal-based scenarios, problem-based learning, anchored instruction). Self-regulated learning seems separate from these.

Also, limiting the literature review to one particular journal simply because it was the first to publish on the subject in Korea seems like a weak argument. Are there currently any other peer-reviewed journals publishing relevant articles? If so, they should be included to provide a fuller picture of the trends in Korea and avoid potential misrepresentation.

The recommendations for future research are mostly consistent with the findings discussed in the paper and provide useful guidance for researchers.

In general there are problems with verb tense, with too much shifting from present perfect to past perfect to past tense.

## Asia Pacific Education Review (APER)

Education Research Institute (ERI) Seoul National University, Seoul, Korea APER (Asia Pacific Education Review) is the journal which is being published biannually by the Education Research Institute at Seoul National University, South Korea. The institute was established in December of 1999 in order to educate specialists and scholars who can work for the development of Asian and Pacific education.

The main purpose of APER is to facilitate the exchange of disciplined inquiries of educational problems and issues and promote research and professional development among Asia-Pacific scholars, researchers, and educators. APER publishes theoretical and empirical papers, book reviews, and program development and applications pertinent to all areas of Asia-Pacific education.

APER (Asia Pacific Education Review ) is the journal which is being published biannually by the Education Research Institute at Seoul National University, South Korea. APER is indexed and abstracted in SSCI(Social Science Citation Index) since 2005.

## Editorial Board of Asia Pacific Education Review

Editor

Yong-lin Moon Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Psychology

**Executive Editor** 

Jongho Shin Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Psychology

**Associate Editors** 

Syed Farid Alatas Singapore, National University of Singapore, Sociology

Sun-Geun Baek Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Measurement & Evaluation

Mark Bray Hong Kong, Hong Kong University, Comparative Education

Harry Daniels USA, University of Florida, Counseling Psychology Yong Hwan Jo Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Anthropology

Eunsun Joo Korea, Duksung Women's University, Counseling Psychology

Kyung Hi Kim Korea, Kyungnam University, Lifelong Education

Cheol Il Lim Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Technology

Jang-ho Park Korea, Kyungsung University, Ethics

Bernard Spodek USA, Univ. of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, Early Childhood Education Bruce. E. Wampold USA, University of Wisconsin-Madison, Counseling Psychology

Chang-Dai Kim Korea, Seoul National University, Counseling Psychology

Advisory Editors

Don Adams USA, University of Pittsburgh, Comparative Education **Bob Adamson** UK, Liverpool Hope Univ., English Language Studies Yash Bhagwanji USA, Florida Atlantic Univ., Teacher Education Philip Altbach USA, Boston College, Comparative Education

Brian J. Caldwell Australia, University of Melbourne, Comparative Education & Leadership

Yin Cheong Cheng Hong Kong, Hong Kong Institute of Education, Education Leadership and School

Puncky P. Heppner USA, University of Missouri-Columbia, Counseling Psychology

Heribert Hinzen Germany, German Adult Education Association John D. Hoge USA, University of Georgia, Social Science Education Peter Jarvis UK, University of Surrey, Lifelong Education

Shuh-Ren Jin Taiwan, National Taiwan Normal University, Counseling Psychology

Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Philosophy Ahnjung Kim Jae-Woong Kim Korea, Sogang University, Educational Policy and Administration Korea, Ewha Womans University, Counseling Psychology Dong Yul Lee

Toshiyuki Mizukosh Japan, Kansai Univ., Educational Technology

Philip K. Piele USA, University of Oregon, Educational Administration Charles M. Reigeluth USA, Indiana University-Bloomington, Educational Technology Ilju Rha Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Technology Tae Keon Rhee Korea, Inha University, Social Studies Education

Singapore, Nanyang Technological Univ., Psychological Studies Oon-Seng Tan

Mehmet Fatih Ta?ar Turkey, Gazi Univ., Science Education Gene Roth USA, Northern Illinois University, HRD

Taiwan, National Taiwan Nomal University, Counseling Psychology Hsiu-Lan Tien Korea, Seoul National University, Educational Administration Chung Il Yun Gay Garland Reed USA, University of Hawaii, Social Cultural Contexts of Education. Roger Myers USA, Columbia University Teachers College, Counseling Psychology

Copy Editor

Anthony C. Banks UK, University of London, Law